



Co-funded by the
Erasmus+ Programme
of the European Union

PAQUALITY

Public Administration Education Quality Enhancement

Erasmus+ Strategic Partnership KA203

No – 2018-1-SK01-KA203-046330

Slovakia, 09/2018-08/2021

PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION EDUCATION IN CROATIA

**(country report prepared for the intellectual output 01 – Assessment of
methodology and materials of public administration teaching and its
relevance for practice)**

March 2019

Author1: professor dr Ivan Koprčić

Faculty of Law, University of Zagreb, e-mail: ikopric@pravo.hr

Author2: dr Anamarija Musa, associate professor (corresponding author)

Faculty of Law, University of Zagreb, e-mail: amusa@pravo.hr

Note: The report expresses an opinion of the authors. The EC doesn't have responsibility for any utilization of included information.

CONTENT

- 1. Introduction..... 3
- 2. National educational system and PA education and training 4
 - 2.1 Public administration as a discipline in Croatia..... 4
 - 2.2 PA education and its specifics 5
 - 2.3 Requirements on entrance to civil service and on in-service training..... 7
 - 2.4. Summary..... 11
- 3. Evaluation and accreditation system and PA study programmes..... 12
 - 3.1 Existing evaluation and accreditation system and PA study programmes 12
 - 3.2 External quality assurance and PA study programmes 14
 - 3.3 Internal quality assurance framework 15
 - 3.4 Anticipated changes 16
 - 3.5 Summary..... 17
- 4. Existing PA study programmes..... 19
 - 4.1 Data, methods and limitations 19
 - 4.2 Existing PA study programmes 21
 - 4.3 AVAILABILITY OF INFORMATION ON PA STUDY PROGRAMMES..... 27
 - 4.4 Summary..... 28
- 5. CONCLUDING REMARKS, POINTS FOR PRACTITIONERS, CHALLENGES FOR FUTURE 29
 - 5.1 Concluding remarks..... 29
 - 5.2 Points and recommendations for practitioners 29
 - 5.3 Challenges for future 31
- 6. REFERENCES 33
- 7. Annex..... 35

1. INTRODUCTION

The PAQUALITY projects aims to support changes in the area of public administration (PA) education in conformity with Bologna objectives, mainly:

- Promotion of European co-operation in quality assurance with a view to developing comparable criteria and methodologies, and
- Promotion of the necessary European dimensions in higher education, particularly with regards to curricular development, inter-institutional co-operation, mobility schemes and integrated programs of study, training and research, which haven't been fully applied in the area of the public administration high education in Slovakia and the new EU states yet.

High education public administration programs vary a lot especially in the Central and Eastern European member countries of the EU - in the new EU member states (NMS). From this perspective it is highly relevant to facilitate quality assurance mechanism which would ensure not only comparable quality of education processes but also comparable outcomes of the education (e.g. quality of graduates, their knowledge, skills and experience) in these countries.

In addition, the project aims at tackling skills gaps and mismatches in the area of public administration high education through designing and developing curricula that meet the learning needs of students that are relevant to the labour market and societal needs, including through better use of open and on-line, work based, multi - disciplinary learning and new quality assessment criteria. Simultaneously, with a view of this priority, promoting and rewarding excellence in teaching and skills development, training of academics in new and innovative pedagogical approaches, new curriculum design approaches and sharing of good practices through collaborative platforms will be in the centre of the project.

This report on Croatia represents an input for the intellectual output 01 of the PAQUALITY project. Within this intellectual output country studies developed based on guidelines and surveys are anticipated. The studies will be used in other project phases but also for mutual information of the project partners at the beginning of the project.

This report summarizes findings on

- the national educational system related to present state of PA education,
- system of evaluation
- findings on PA programmes existing in Croatia
- attractiveness of the PA programmes

The Report is based on data available as of 10 March 2019.

2. NATIONAL EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM AND PA EDUCATION AND TRAINING

2.1 PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AS A DISCIPLINE IN CROATIA

The development of the public administration as a discipline in Croatia can be traced back to 18th century when the Empress Maria Theresia established the very first educational institution devoted to administrative education in Croatia for education of royal administrative service (The Political-Cameral Study (*Studium politico-camerale in regnis Dalmatiae, Croatiae et Slavoniae*) was established on 17 July 1769 in Varaždin, Croatian capital at that time. Its only professor Adam Adalbert Barić, taught his PA students by using the well-known three-parts textbook of the Viennese professor Joseph von Sonnenfels *Grundsätze der Polizey, Handlung und Finanzwissenschaft* (1765, 1767, 1772) thus promoting the cameralism as a doctrine, a discipline, and a political orientation. In 1776 the Political-Cameral Study was merged with the newly founded Faculty of Law in Zagreb, which was a part of new Royal Academy of Science (*Regia scientiarum Academia Zagrabiensis*; Pavić, 2003: 197–198). Among four chairs, one was given to professor Barić to teach cameral studies and economic sciences.

Through the following decades the primary orientation of PA teaching towards economic values and practical skills, was gradually replaced by the legal orientation, given the fact that it was organised within the law study. Legalism had slowly developed as the important orientation in administrative education, reflecting the new societal expectations conceptualising public administration as strictly limited by law. The legality principle had slowly becoming one of the main administrative principles, suppressing and substituting – to a degree – organisational rationality, efficiency, and economy principles. The rule of law came into focus. Two main disciplines focused on public administration of that time were administrative science (*doctrina administrationis*) and administrative law (*ius administrationis publicae*). At the beginning of 20th century, Professor Vinko Barić establish rather balanced combination of legalism and organisational rationality within his system of analysing public administration. He taught administrative science and administrative law as two separate educational subjects of the law study by 1927. In the following period the PA teaching by professor Ivo Krbek has started to incline to normativism. His three-book administrative law system, with the second book devoted to organisation of public administration, but purely in legalistic manner, was used for several decades, during three different societal, political and administrative systems, from the Kingdom of Yugoslavia, through the regime established during the Second World War, to post-war socialism (Pavić, 2003: 200-206).

In 1956 the Chair of Administrative Science was established, and its new head Professor Eugen Pusić, strongly promoted administrative science as theoretically grounded empirical discipline, fostering robust empirical researches, and actively cooperating with colleagues from all over the world. Professor Pusić himself was extremely fruitful and worldly recognized administrative scientists, who among other important achievements, authored a book *American Public Administration* in 1954, served as the UN expert, lectured at the Stanford University and other universities worldwide and published (alone or with his colleagues) a number of fundamental books which substantively contributed to the respectable body of knowledge about public administration, administrative institutions, politico-administrative relations, and the role of public administration in a society (Pavić, 2003: 205-206).

In addition to the PA teaching at the Faculty of Law, the two separate PA institutions were established in the mid-1950s, offering the PA study separated from law study. In 1956 the High School of Administration was founded in Zagreb (*Visoka upravna škola*), offering at first the 2-year programme, which later developed in 3-year and 4-year PA programme. The School joined the University of Zagreb in 1962, as an autonomous full member. There were only two legal subjects in the curriculum, while the majority of subjects were closely connected to public administration in a

western-type of curricula. Many have assessed that this study was the best public administration study in socialist Yugoslavia and on right track to become a modern university public administration study, with 1.600 graduates in the short period of its existence – namely, because of various internal academic processes, the School was suddenly merged with the Faculty of Law and disappeared along with separated public administration study (Pavić, 2003: 207–208). The other HEI was so so-called Higher Administrative School (Viša upravna škola), established in 1957. The study programme was rather modern, although much more legally oriented than the programme of the High School of Administration. The Higher Administrative School was also merged with the Faculty of Law, in 1983. However, a separate 2-year PA programme outlived that institution. It was abolished only in 1998, when the new Social Sciences Polytechnic was founded in Zagreb (Pavić, 2003: 208–209).

The Social Sciences Polytechnics in Zagreb designed a 3-year BA programme for administrative lawyers in 1998, substantially reoriented from normative (legal) disciplines to modern public administration study in 2005, within Bologna reform of high education system in Croatia. The Social Science Polytechnics was dissolved at the end of 2011, but three-year public administration study continues within the Faculty of Law in Zagreb, supplemented by the 2-years graduate (MA) public administration programme from 2013, within the framework of the Study Centre for Public Administration and Public Finances established in 2011. The new group of researchers has taken over the dominant position in PA teaching and research in Croatia during the second half of 2000s and in 2010s with Ivan Koprić as the chair.

At the other law faculties and vocational schools, two-year public administrative studies were also founded during the 1980s and 1990 educating the so-called administrative lawyers as a kind of vocational education,¹ till the Bologna Reform of 2005. The other three law faculties as well as some polytechnics also developed 3years BA and 2 years MA programmes (upgraded from 1-year programme since 2013). At the postgraduate level, the Faculty of Law in Zagreb organized a postgraduate Master of Science in public administration in 1961. Admission was possible for lawyers and political science graduates. About 60 students acquired the degree between 1961 and 2005, when the study was dissolved. In 2006, Doctoral Study of Public Law and Public Administration was established at the same Faculty. It is intended only for lawyers, again with a possibility to admit graduates from political science.

In sum, the fact that for the last 235 years the PA programmes in Croatia were developed more or less without interruption (most significant being 1950s-1970s with specialised PA schools) at the faculties of law makes the programmes, teaching and research legally oriented. However, in addition to the certain periods, the newest PA programmes, especially the programmes taught in Zagreb, offer a study grounded in PA discipline (see Annex 2).

2.2 PA EDUCATION AND ITS SPECIFICS

As described in the previous chapter, the public administration as a discipline has been developing predominantly with in the HEIs specialised in legal studies. In fact, the sole core of the legal studies can be found back in the 18th century in the politico-cameral (administrative) studies. So, in Croatia, as in many CEE and SEE countries, the public administration as a discipline has a significant legal background.

However, with the ‘Bologna reform’, privatisation and the diversification of the HEIs and the studies (university and professional studies; public and private HEIs; BA, MA, postgraduate studies), the PA education development has witnessed the multiplication of the PA programmes

¹ Croatia has had a binary high education system since the mid-1990s, with university programmes on one hand and vocational programmes on the other. Vocational programmes can be organised by colleges, by polytechnics, and, recently, by public universities.

and the development of the programmes with the economy-management core or programmes with the regional and local level orientation.²

HEIs in Croatia have recently developed various programmes that are either public administration programmes (public administration, study of administration or public management) or programmes that by their content and outcomes educates students primarily for the employment in the public sector (local and regional development, etc.).

In the last 10 years the number of study programmes has doubled, with introduction of 2-year PA programmes at the MA level being the most evident change, followed by the greater diversification at the postgraduate level. Almost all study programmes (except one) have been performed by public HEI (universities and polytechnics); four Croatian faculties of law have the dominant position among them, offering in total 11 programmes (4 BA; 4 MA, 2 specialist, one doctoral and one joint doctoral programme).

Table 1 Public administration study programmes in Croatia, 2009, 2012, and 2019

Degree	Croatia 2009	Croatia 2012	Croatia 2019
Bachelor (3 years; vocational)	7	8	8
Specialist (1 year; vocational)	–	3	-
Specialist (2 years; vocational)	–	–	6
Bachelor (3 years; university)	–	–	-
Master's (2 years; university)	–	–	-
Specialist (1-1.5year; university)	5	6	7
Specialist (2 years; university)	–	1	1
Ph. D. or doctoral (3 years; university)	1	1	4
Σ	13	19	26

Source: Koprić et al., 2012a and authors' calculation (see Annex)

The future developments in relation to PA programmes might be affected by the several circumstances.

First, there is a significant pressure to establish the MA university programme of public administration, which would, together with PhD programme constitute a basis for a pool of future experts and researchers in PA. So far, the MA university programmes (nor BA whatsoever) have not been established, and the professional programmes graduates have no possibility to continue their studies at the postgraduate level.

Secondly, the outcomes of the qualification framework jobs and competences descriptions may have an impact on the future programmes. The second EU funded project on the development of the qualification framework in the areas of law and public administration (*Providentia Studiorum Iuris*, 2019-2021, following the earlier project *Iurisprudencia 2015-2016*) is currently being carried out. Also, work on the systematisation of the Croatian Qualifications Framework may result in more precise standards of administrative education on the “demand side” (cf. also below). A

² In addition, public administration education exists also at the 4th level of education (high-school level, a level below higher education). The students who opt for the vocational education (in contrast to gymnasiums) may choose to study at the administrative-bureau-technical schools. Such administrative schools, as in Zagreb in 1961, or programs within the economic and bureau-technical schools prepared the students to work immediately after graduation at the lower positions in the administration, without continuing their education at university or professional academic level. The work posts and managerial positions in public administration that require such qualification are work posts and positions type III, compared to work posts or positions type II that require minimum a BA diploma, and work posts or positions type I that require MA level diploma.

separate working group deals with the standards of professions in the fields of law, political science, sociology, and public administration and public sector (Sectoral council XIX. Law, political science, sociology, state administration and public affairs).

Thirdly, the general trend towards the STEM area, and IT especially, could have a negative impact on the future admission quotas for social sciences, including the PA programmes at the public universities and polytechnics. Moreover, the data on unemployment³ of the BA and MA graduates of public administration (220 and 60 in 2017) could also have an effect to the decision on the number of PA programmes and students admitted to the PA programmes.

Fourthly, it could be expected that the current PA programmes at all level would invest into attractiveness of their programmes, from the design (e.g. doctoral programmes being more research oriented; BA professional programmes being more practice oriented), courses in English, online courses, and general marketing (availability of information), including the agreements with local and regional governments for the education of their employees. In addition, the legal framework could finally recognise postgraduate specialist studies and ensure that the students who successfully finish these studies experience an increase in salary, compared to the doctoral students (and former master of science students).

2.3 REQUIREMENTS ON ENTRANCE TO CIVIL SERVICE AND ON IN-SERVICE TRAINING

It can be noted a continuous development of the supply side in the field of administrative education after 1990, while the demand side is a bit underdeveloped. There are interconnections between the type of governance and the type of public administrative education in certain territory, in terms that better administrative education can significantly contribute to good governance. *Vice versa* is also true,⁴ in both meanings: good governance requires improvements in administrative education and ill governance hinders administrative education betterment. Full professionalism and development of proper high-quality administrative education and training have never been highly appreciated in Croatia.

Although the statement that »systematic training programmes are essential to ensure the quality of (future) government officials« (Accreditation Criteria, 2011: 2) is today widely accepted in academic environment, it is not really in the hearts of decision-makers, at least not in some transitional countries. It can be hypothesized that such an attitude, that well-educated professionals in public administration can be replaced by the courageous and determined political appointees, is one of the causes and elements of governance malfunctioning in certain countries and regions.

Governments should explicitly list their educational expectations (»labour market demands«) in order to employ the best people in the civil service, and universities should adapt their supply to such expectations in order to gain »credibility from potential employers of their graduates« (Toonen, Verheijen, 1999: 193). Such attempts, which are increasingly often present in the field, to connect programmes with the needs of practice lead to demand-driven design of educational programmes. However, there are still noticeable regrets that »curricula are developed on the basis of tradition and 'supply' capacities« (Nemec et al., 2011: 136).

The first official document containing the clear requirements about administrative education and in-service training was the State Administration Reform Strategy for the period 2008-2011. The new Public Administration Development Strategy for the period 2015-2020 continuously supports

³ <http://www.vus.hr/upload/stranice/2019/01/2019-01-07/173/elaboratsusvus3918.pdf>

⁴ The idea is not quite new – see, for example, Randma-Liiv, Connaughton, 2005; Newland assesses that public administration schools »... have tended to act situationally ...« and can facilitate societal transformation in Hungary, Poland and Moldova (1996: 385, 388); Bouckaert shows how administrative reforms influence research and teaching public administration (2008: 11); etc.

modernisation of administrative education and more robust in-service training. However, in practice, requirements on entrance to civil service are not focused on proper administrative education. Educational requirements for particular posts in civil service are widely established, meaning that for a particular post several different studies are taken into account as appropriate, following imprecise job descriptions.

The job descriptions for civil service (state administration) rarely requires exclusively PA education at the BA and even more rarely at the MA level. The conditions are usually described as a 'BA/MA in social sciences, including law, economy, etc.'. So, it is a rule at equal footing with other disciplines (social sciences in general and law, economy, and other more specific). On the other hand, the work posts and positions of education below academic education (high school diploma in administration) are often described as administrative. BA or specialist degree in public administration is more often the educational prerequisite for employment by the local governments, especially in certain parts of Croatia (North-West, and some others).

It has to be noted also that postgraduate specialist studies are almost not recognised in the job descriptions, impeding the motivation of students to enrol in the PA postgraduate programmes. For some posts it is an additional asset. Moreover, in comparison to PhD programmes that guarantee 15% higher salary (mainly, if the PhD is in relation to the job description) or former Master of Science programmes that do so for 8%, the postgraduate specialist studies are recognised only in some local administrations that offer 4% higher salary to the employees that complete such a study.

In addition to the lack of the postgraduate requirements for the work posts, for 50.000 civil servants who once complete their studies, the postgraduate study does not bring any advancement or salary raise. It has to be noted, however, that in some state administration institutions the civil servants are being offered to enrol into the postgraduate study at the expense of the state budget (decision is resting on the head of the institutions, though). The fact that the completion of postgraduate studies rarely lead to the advancement or the rise in salary, as well as the fact that the student or the employee has to bear the costs of the postgraduate studies (compared to the BA or MA studies), could have a negative impact on the number of students enrolling into postgraduate studies. The City of Zagreb is probably the most positive example of continuous support to administrative education at the postgraduate level. Zagreb, similar to some other larger towns, gives scholarships to selected servants and guarantees 4% higher salary to them after graduation.

INTERNSHIP AND STATE EXAM

In principle, the civil service begins with an internship. Croatia has two internship schemes that function simultaneously. In the past decade the new scheme (*without employment*) has been more popular and more frequently used, at the expense of the *traditional* one.

The *traditional-type* interns have to train for 12 months and have to pass the State Exam in the subsequent period of six months. They are state or local servants with secondary education, bachelor or master degrees. The purpose of internship is to train the people of adequate educational background but without work experience for autonomous, independent, professional and efficient work at their respective posts. The internship has to increase civil servants' capacities, ease the internal mobility of staff and increase the effectiveness of public administration. The training of interns is implemented by means of practical work and through learning in line with established programmes.

Since the employment of interns in state administration has to be planned in the annual recruitment plans, the number of interns can be assessed based on these plans. For example, in the core state administration (employing about 29,400 civil servants; without police, military force and some other parts of state administration) it was planned to recruit 794 new civil servants in 2018 (2,7%), i.e. 412 persons with previous work experience and 382 interns (without previous work experience).

Local governments also plan their needs for interns on annual basis, but consolidated data on the number of interns in local government system do not exist. Each local government is autonomous in its personnel policy, but it can be observed that internship is practiced in many cities, municipalities, and counties. For example, the City of Zagreb planned to recruit 53 interns in 2018 (1,77%, since Zagreb is employing about 3,000 civil servants and employees).

There are two main parts of the Internship Programme that are the basis for the training of interns during internship in the state administrative and other bodies. The training of interns is led by mentors and controlled by internship monitoring committees.

The general part of the state service internship programme is identical for all interns with the same educational level. It consists of a) introduction to the state service and b) preparations for the general part of state examination. Both training modules are provided by the State School of Public Administration, which is a separate public institution under the control and guidance of the Ministry of Public Administration and the Government of the Republic of Croatia.

The preparation of special parts of the internship programme is decentralized. Each state body has a duty to establish a special training programme for its own interns. It shall encompass three main elements: a) informing and familiarising with the competences of the body and with regulations relevant to that body and to the profession or type of tasks within that body, b) practical work, c) preparations for the special part of state examination. Final approval and coordination of all the special parts of internship programme is a task of the Ministry of Public Administration.

The new internship scheme (*without employment*) was introduced in 2009 by the Labour Act as a measure for the preparation of young people for the labour market. Since April 2011 new scheme has been explicitly provided for and regulated in some details by the amendments to the State Servants Act. It has been more frequently used since 2012 because the participants have been remunerated and the employers financially supported by the state. The coverage of that measure has been very wide and it can be utilised in various labour sectors, including the civil service.

Although the measure was not tailored particularly for the civil service, the conditions are more favourable in public administration than in the private sector. This type of internship takes place *without employment*, on strictly temporary basis, with significantly reduced rights of participants, who are declared, by the law, not to be the civil servants. The new internship scheme is more flexible and less regulated. It is time-limited, with very narrow rights of interns.

This internship scheme enables young people without work experience necessary to enter the state examination procedure and without possibility to get the initial work experience in their profession, to fulfil necessary preconditions for taking the State Exam and thus to increase their chances for employment in the civil service. There are no special rights or advantages of this type of interns after their completion of internship.

Candidates under 30 years of age with at least 30 days of official unemployment status are eligible. Students and candidates over 30 years of age are not eligible. The intern has a right to monthly compensation of 2,751.84 kuna (about 370 €), paid by the Croatian Employment Service, and a right to travelling expenses, paid by the employer. The Croatian Employment Service also pays social contributions and education costs (if they exist) for these interns. While in the beginning financial sources for this internship scheme were combined from the state budget and the EU funds, today they are fully provided through the EU funds.

The coordinator of this scheme is the Croatian Employment Service. All state bodies are able to include this scheme into their annual recruitment plans, but they need to get the previous consent of the ministries of public administration (for the need and capacities for internship) and finances (for financial resources). The interested state body has to prepare a training programme which includes mentor's name. The mentor has to fulfil conditions with regard to profession, level of education and

work experience at relevant posts, according to a form prepared by the Croatian Employment Service.

Recruitment plans for internship without civil service employment are issued annually, but in decentralised manner. The consolidated data about the number of participants in this scheme in the state administration and in the whole public administration do not exist. However, the Ministry of Public Administration has published the individual recruitment plans of state bodies since 2014. For example, 454 participants used this opportunity in 2010, while there were 1,423 participants recruited during 2015 and 2016. Further, there is an assessment that in the whole public sector (with about 400,000 employed people) there are, in average, 10,000 participants using this measure in every moment.

The new internship scheme is a part of general measures for fighting the unemployment of young people, mostly financed from the EU funds. The issues connected with implementation of that measure in public administration are non-transparent selection procedures, huge turnover of interns because organizations tend to replace interns at the same post without employment, and weak chances of finding a vacant permanent post after completion of such internship.

In-service training system is being developed with moderate success. A central state institution for in-service training started to function in June 2005. It operated as the Civil Servants' Training Centre within the Central State Office for Public Administration (until 2009) and the Ministry of Public Administration (after 2009) until 2011, when it was merged with the Academy of Local Democracy into a new institution called the State School for Public Administration. During eight years, these institutions performed 1,075 training programmes with 46,758 civil servants participating in them (Bošnjaković, 2015). According to the annual reports of the State School of Public Administration for 2016 and 2017, in 2017 for example, the school performed 271 training programmes with 5.830 participants (civil, local and public servants), while in 2016 it performed 222 training programmes with 5.941 participants.⁵

Along with that, many training programmes have been organized by the other institutions, such as the Diplomatic Academy, the Judicial Academy, the Tax Administration, the Customs, the Ministry of Regional Development, etc. In the recent years, the Higher Education Institutions (HEI) are incentivised to prepare and offer a life-long-learning programmes, as short education programmes, with some of them offering specific education for public administration (e.g. Administrative Procedure, Public Procurement, Personal Data Protection, etc., mainly at the Faculty of Law in Zagreb).

The formal exam is necessary for the entrance to civil service.⁶ The civil servant is required to pass the exam within 6 months after the trial work. If he/she fails to pass the exam, the civil service employment ends with the last day of the deadline. The only exceptions to the obligation to pass the exam are persons who passed the bar exam and (but only in relation to the special part) persons holding doctoral or master of science degree in the specific area related to the work post, persons that have completed the one-year course at the Diplomatic academy and state auditors. The institution covers the costs of the exam. The exam is taken before the State Exam Commission.

The exam has two parts. The general part, which is common to all civil servants and is an oral exam, is testing the knowledge on the constitutional order, state administration, local government, administrative procedure and administrative dispute, records management, civil service system and basics of the EU system. The special part of the exam, which has both oral and written part, is related

⁵ State School of Public Administration (2017) Annual Work Report for 2016, March 2017, https://www.dsju.hr/official-documents/DSJU_lzviestaj-o-radu-za-2016_final.pdf

State School of Public Administration (2018) Annual Work Report for 2017, March 2018, https://dsju.hr/dsju/about_us/dokumenti-02-10-2014

⁶ Law on Civil Service, Articles 56-60

to the special work post. However, the civil servant is not required to pass the exam (special part of the exam) when changing the work posts.

The changes in the design of the state exam are announced by the Ministry of Administration and are expected to be completed in 2019.

Deep politicization is a continuous feature and one of the main problems of the Croatian civil service. The problem has usually been approached formally, through amendments to the Law and reshaping of the appointment procedure for managerial positions in public administration. However, the appointment procedure for these positions is only a pinnacle of the politicization problem in public administration. Politicisation discourages the professionalism of civil servants and devastates tiny administrative capacities. Fast promotion of the obedient and politically privileged servants sends a negative motivational message to the others. Education and competence turn out to be less important. Political criteria have sometimes been imposed even in access to professional training.

Finally, in order to assess or evaluate the PA programmes in one country, one has to bear in mind the size of public sector employment, which constitutes a labour market for the public administrators at all levels. The complete and up to date data which would include employment in all parts of public sector in Croatia is not existent. The combination of available official data⁷ indicate that the approximate number of employees in the public sector (state administration, local administration, public services, including public companies) in 2018 was 304.457, which is slightly more than 293.000 indicated by the World Bank for 2014. This means that almost one fifth of Croatian workforce is employed in public sector (19.6%). The core public administration employs slightly less than 25% of total public administration employment. Such data indicate a relatively huge welfare sector (about 186,500 employees, or 61.3%), but there is also significant employment in public agencies (about 24,000 employees, or 7.9%) and in the Army. In sum, given the fact that around 20% of all employees in Croatia find their jobs in public sector, one would expect a respectable offer of different PA programmes and their recognition in the structure of public administration.

2.4. SUMMARY

<p>2.1. Is PA education in your country specific for some reasons? If yes, why?</p>	<p>Croatia has a long tradition of PA education, which developed predominately at the faculties of law, as a part of legal studies and has a legal orientation. The Faculty of Law in Zagreb has the most developed PA education programmes, ranging from BA and MA professional PA programmes, postgraduate specialist programmes, and doctoral programme of Public Law and Public Administration which generated the majority of PA teachers and researchers.</p>
<p>2.2. Is PA a well-established own (inter-) discipline?</p>	<p>Yes, the discipline of PA is recognised as a specific discipline in the greater branch of law, but also as an interdisciplinary study.</p>
<p>2.3. Is any formal exam required for entrance to civil service? If yes, what are the requirements?</p>	<p>Yes, each civil servant has to pass the state civil service exam within 6 months after completing the trial work upon admission to service. The exam is composed out of general (constitutional and administrative system and procedure) and special part (related to a specific job post), and is both oral and written and is taken before the State Exam Commission.</p>

⁷ These are the data published by the State Statistics Bureau, and by the Ministry of Public Administration, including the data from the Register of public servants (which does not cover all employees, available here: <https://uprava.gov.hr/statisticki-prikaz/14431>), as well as the Eurostat data.

3. EVALUATION AND ACCREDITATION SYSTEM AND PA STUDY PROGRAMMES

3.1 EXISTING EVALUATION AND ACCREDITATION SYSTEM AND PA STUDY PROGRAMMES

The evaluation and accreditation system in Croatia corresponds to the European wide system of general evaluation and accreditation of study programmes within the European Higher Education Area.⁸ There is no special accreditation or evaluation system for the PA programmes meaning that the PA programmes (as well as the institutions providing such programmes) undergo only general accreditation and evaluation procedures.

The accreditation and evaluation procedures are regulated by the Law on Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education of 2009⁹, the Law on the Scientific Activity and Higher Education,¹⁰ and bylaws (e.g. the Ordinance on issuing a licence for the carrying out the higher education work, study programmes and the reaccreditation of HEIs)¹¹ and general acts and guidelines (e.g. rules on the procedure of the initial accreditation, reaccreditation, audit etc.),

In 2009 the Law on Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education established the new and improved system of accreditation and evaluation of study programmes in higher education and strengthened the position, powers and independence of the Agency for Science and Higher Education (ASHE).

The current system of quality assurance includes external and internal evaluation system of quality assurance and development. They are based on the national, international and European standards such as the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG),¹² competences framework, and other documents.

The external evaluation system includes (1) the procedure of initial accreditation of HEI (and scientific organisations), (2) the procedure of initial accreditation of a study programme, (3) the re-accreditation of HEI, (4) the external periodical evaluation of the internal quality assurance system (audit), and (5) the thematic evaluation.

The Croatian Parliament adopts the strategic documents on the network of HEIs and the network of public scientific organisations, containing guidelines and criteria for establishing HEIs and their study programmes, and public scientific organisations as well as projections of establishment of the new HEIs, programmes and public scientific organisations, as part of external system of quality assurance and development, following proposal of the National Science, Higher Education and Technology Council.

The Agency for Science and Higher Education (ASHE) was established in 2004 by the Government Regulation of the Croatian Government¹³ to perform evaluation of the study programmes and the recognition of the academic qualifications (ENIC/NARIC). Within the general improvement of the accreditation and evaluation system in 2009 the Law on Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education strengthened the ASHE in terms of independence and powers. The main tasks of the ASHE

⁸ https://eacea.ec.europa.eu/national-policies/eurydice/content/quality-assurance-higher-education-11_en

⁹ The Law on Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education, Official Gazette Narodne novine no. 45/2009, English version available at the webpage of the ASHE: https://www.azvo.hr/images/stories/o_nama/Act_on_Quality_Assurance_in_Science_and_Higher_Education.pdf

¹⁰ Official Gazette Narodne novine no. 123/03, 105/04, 174/04, 2/07, 46/07, 45/09, 63/11, 94/13, 139/13, 101/14, 60/15, 131/17, unofficial translation available at the webpage of the ASHE https://www.azvo.hr/images/stories/o_nama/Act_on_Scientific_Activity-UNOFFICIAL_TRANSLATION.pdf

¹¹ Official gazette Narodne novine no. 24/2010

¹² ESG version 2015 https://www.azvo.hr/images/stories/kvaliteta/ESG_2015_EN.pdf

¹³ Official Gazette Narodne novine no. 101/2004, 8/2007

are to participate in the procedure of initial accreditation and re-accreditation and to carry out the procedures of thematic evaluation, and of audit (external independent periodical evaluation).

In the procedure of initial accreditation and re-accreditation the ASHE issues the accreditation recommendation as an independent professional opinion of the Agency which is passed on the basis of the carried-out evaluation procedure. It is the basis for the Ministry of Science and Higher Education (MSHE) to make a decision on the outcome of an evaluation procedure (to issue a licence), and to grant the HEI the right to start carrying out the study programme or conduct activity.

The National Science, Higher Education and Technology Council is the body responsible for the overall scientific and technological development.

THE STRUCTURE AND POWERS OF THE ASHE

The structure and powers of the ASHE are regulated by the Law on Quality Assurance in Higher Education and further elaborated in the Statute of the ASHE.

The ASHE bodies are a) the Management Board, b) the Director and c) the Accreditation Council. The ASHE may also establish other professional and counselling bodies. ASHE currently has 64 employees.

The Management Board (Articles 8-9) is the governing body consisting of the president and eight members who are appointed by the Croatian Parliament for a term of 4 years, except one member who is appointed by the ASHE from the ranks of its employees. The composition of the Management board is designed as to represent all relevant stakeholder's groups (HEIs, students, the state). The Croatian Parliament appoints (and discharges) the president and seven members upon nomination by the Government (president and 2 members), Rectors' conference (1 member), Council of Polytechnics and Schools of Professional Higher Education (1 member), National Science, Higher Education and Technology Council (2 members), Croatian Students Council (1 member). The president or the members of the Management board can be discharged only in cases strictly prescribed by law. The Management Board's tasks include the adoption of the Statute and other general acts of the ASHE, the appointment and the discharge of the Director, deputies and assistant directors, the adoption of the annual programme and the annual report, the adoption of the budget and the financial report and other management related activities.

The Director of the Agency (Articles 10-12) is the managing and professional head of the ASHE, appointed and removed from office by the Management Board. The director is appointed on the basis of a public call for the period of 4 years with a possibility of re-appointment. The conditions are prescribed in the Statute. The ASHE is managed by the same Director from its establishment (professor dr Jasmina Havranek). The Director represents the ASHE, is responsible for the management of the agency and conducts the activities in accordance with the annual plan and the strategy (which is also drafted by the director).

The Accreditation Council is a professional body of the Agency, composed by representatives of the system of science and higher education. Structure, mandate, authority and methods of work are regulated by the Statute of the Agency. The Accreditation council has 11 members who are appointed for a term of 4 years by the Management board and upon the proposal of the Director taking into account the representation of all relevant stakeholders (Rectors' council, Council of Polytechnics and Schools of Professional Higher Education, Croatian Commerce Chamber, Croatian Students Council, National Science, Higher Education and Technology Council, scientific institutes, scientists and members of the academic community on the basis of the public call). The Accreditation Council is the ASHE expert body which adopts the documentation for external evaluation procedures and issues the final opinion on the quality of higher education institutions and scientific organisations.

The ASHE has become a full member of European Association for Quality Assurance in Higher Education [ENQA](#) and has been listed in European Quality Assurance Register for Higher Education [EQAR](#) in 2011, the Agency proved its reliability as a quality assurance agency working in.

The ASHE's main tasks (among others) are as follows:

- a) participates in the procedures of initial accreditation,
- b) carries out the procedures of reaccreditation, thematic evaluation, and of audit (external independent periodical evaluation)
- c) collects and process data on the science and higher education system, and establishes standards and criteria for the evaluation procedures
- d) carries out the procedure of professional recognition of qualifications
- e) provides information about enrolment at HEIs

With regarding to the accountability of the ASHE, the Ministry of Science and Higher Education supervises the legality of the activities of the ASHE. The ASHE is obliged to submit its annual report to the Croatian Parliament.

3.2 EXTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE AND PA STUDY PROGRAMMES

As described above, the only external quality assurance procedure of the PA programmes is the general one, applicable to all study programmes and HEIs.

The legal framework for the accreditation and the evaluation of study programmes is set up by the Law on the Quality Assurance System in the Higher Education.

The criteria are established by the Ordinance on issuing licence for performing higher education activity, carrying out a study programme, and reaccreditation of the higher education institutions.¹⁴ The criteria used for the quality assurance are also those determined by the ENQA and other quality assurance organisations.

The criteria relate to the capacity of the institution (teaching and research quality and quantity, facilities, financial resources), quality of programmes (comparability, contents, mobility, etc.) and feasibility in relation to the strategic documents on the network of HEIs.

INITIAL ACCREDITATION OF A STUDY PROGRAMME

The new programmes (of public or private HEIs) are required to undergo the procedure of initial accreditation in accordance with the Law (Article 20).

The first step is the submission of the request of the HEI to the Ministry at least 1 year before the beginning of the academic year in which the new study programme is to be implemented.

The request shall include (1) the elaboration of the study programme that includes a feasibility study, which was drafted with the participation of teachers from the system of higher education from the scientific field of the study programme the request is submitted for (2) proof of adequate facilities and equipment (3) appropriate number of concluded work contracts with scientific or teaching staff (4) proof that funds have been secured for performing the activities.

The second phase which starts after the Ministry forwards the application to the ASHE, is conducted by the ASHE which determines whether the criteria is fulfilled. The criteria are established by the strategic document on the higher education institutions network.

Upon the evaluation of documentation (within 2 months), the Accreditation council issues a recommendation to the Ministry of Science and Education, which is in essence bound by the recommendation – the positive recommendation will lead to issuing the licence, while the negative recommendation will lead to the withholding the licence.

¹⁴ Official Gazette Narodne novine no. 24/2010; <https://www.azvo.hr/en/about-us/regulations/regulations>

EVALUATION AND QUALITY ASSURANCE

The existing programmes are evaluated within the more complex external quality assurance processes which are carried out by the ASHE:

- In the process of *re-accreditation* of the HEI (article 20) – among other, the study programme is assessed in terms of comparability to accredited degrees in other countries and in terms of the mobility of the students
- In the process of *audit or external periodical evaluation of the internal quality assurance system* (article 21) – again, the study programme and the conditions for its implementation are assessed in relation to the quality standards
- In the process of *thematic evaluation* (article 22) - this type of evaluation is carried out for the purpose of assessing and reviewing the degree of development of organization unit and/or study programme i.e. assessing the quality of performance in relation to comparable units or programmes in the same field of work; so far the thematic evaluation of the PA programmes has not been performed

In the processes of reaccreditation, audit and thematic evaluation, the key position is given to the commissions for evaluation, usually a 5-member consortium composed of three representatives of academic institutions, one representative of the employers, and one student. The procedure is organised and the commission is supported by the coordinator, the employee of the ASHE. Based on the evaluation and conclusions of the evaluation commission, the Accreditation council issues a final recommendation or provides an opinion to the Agency, which reaches a final decision on the outcome of the three above mentioned procedures.

3.3 INTERNAL QUALITY ASSURANCE FRAMEWORK

Each HEI establishes its internal quality assurance and development system by its general acts, in line with the Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG)¹⁵ and legal framework.

This means that the internal quality assurance and development system has to include (1) the policy for quality assurance (including appropriate organisational body/unit and inclusive procedures, the strategy, the rulebook), (2) the adequate and inclusive processes for the design and approval of new programmes, (3) student-centred learning, teaching and assessment, (4) preestablished and publicly available procedures of student admission, progression, recognition and certification, (5) assurance of teacher competences and development (including students' evaluation of the teaching), (6) appropriate funding and delivery of learning resources and student support schemes, (7) high quality information management, (8) all relevant information publicly available, accessible and understandable, (9) established on-going monitoring and review of programmes and (10) cyclical external quality assurance.

The ASHE conducts the audit procedure, a procedure of external periodical evaluation of quality assurance and development at the HEIs, as prescribed by the Article 23 of the Law on Quality Assurance in Higher Education.

All HEIs are required to undergo an audit every 5 years.

¹⁵ ESG version 2015 https://www.azvo.hr/images/stories/kvaliteta/ESG_2015_EN.pdf

Audit is carried out according to the annual plan and the general acts of the ASHE. The detailed Criteria on audit¹⁶ and the Rules on audit¹⁷ are issued by the ASHE. The ASHE also prepared a Handbook for Audit.

After the audit has been carried out, the ASHE publishes a report on its website¹⁸, and issues a certificate with an assessment of a degree of development and efficiency of internal quality assurance system.

If it is established in the audit that the internal quality assurance system of the subject of evaluation is effective, the ASHE issues a certificate of the internal quality assurance system development and effectiveness. On the contrary, if the HEI does not remedy inefficiencies in accordance with the recommendations, the ASHE does not issue a certificate, but can initiate the external audit within the 5 year or initiate a reaccreditation or a thematic evaluation.

After the ASHE publishes the annual plan of the audit, the procedure of audit is comprised of 4 phases: planning, visit, report, and follow up. The central role is one of the Audit Commission that is composed of 5 members representing experts and academic community representatives (3), students (1), and employers' representatives (1). The members are selected on the basis of the database of the ASHE, recommendations of European/international HE organisations, and similar. With the help of the coordinator, the ASHE employee, the Commission conducts the visit and prepares a report, which is the basis for the ASHE to decide on the issuing of the certificate.

3.4 ANTICIPATED CHANGES

At the moment, the new legal framework on the quality assurance in higher education is in the process or preparation, but the draft is not yet publicly available. However, a significant change in relation to the accreditation/evaluation system (institutions, processes, criteria) is not to be expected. In the document from April 2018¹⁹ the representative of the Ministry of Science and Education accentuated that the reasons for the legal framework are necessary in order to make the quality assurance system comparable to other EU countries and to connect the quality of HEIs with the demands from economy and society, including the standards of qualifications. In addition, the initial accreditation and reaccreditation procedures are perceived to be too permeable (meaning that it leads to the establishment of the low-quality programmes). The ENQA evaluation of ASHA has indicated that there are shortcomings in the accreditation of the doctoral programmes. Also, according to the same source, it could be expected that the new legal framework and criteria will give more weight to the internationally oriented programmes (joint degrees, online programmes, programmes in English).

With regard to the public administration programmes there is no sign of the establishment of specific evaluation system. Insofar, and to our knowledge, none of the PA programmes has applied to EAPAA accreditation.

However, with the development of the new qualification framework and the new design of the state exam system (to be completed during 2019), the effects on the PA programmes might be expected, but their direction is still not known.

¹⁶ <http://www.azvo.hr/images/stories/novosti/Kriteriji%20za%20audit.pdf>

¹⁷ <http://www.azvo.hr/images/stories/novosti/Pravilnik%20audit.pdf>

¹⁸ <https://www.azvo.hr/hr/vrednovanja/postupci-vrednovanja-u-visokom-obrazovanju/audit-visokih-ucilista/zavrsna-izvjesca-vanjske-neovisne-periodicne-prosudbe>

¹⁹ <https://dei.srce.hr/sites/default/files/2018-04/Ramljak-Srce-DEI-2018.pdf>

3.5 SUMMARY

<p>3.1 What is the general governance structure with regard to external quality assurance of higher education institutions? Is it the same or is it different for PA programmes?</p>	<p>The new study programmes have to be approved in the process of initial accreditation, while the existing programmes and their implementation are objects of evaluation within the processes of reaccreditation of HEI, the process of audit (external quality assessment) and the thematic evaluation.</p> <p>There is no specific quality assurance procedure for PA programmes.</p>
<p>3.2 Which are the main providers of programme accreditation? Is there a national body (regulator etc), e.g. as an agency under control of the Ministry of Education, responsible for the regulation of accreditation? What is the status of relevant institutions (government authorities, semi-autonomous or independent organizations)?</p>	<p>The main body is the Agency for Science and Higher Education that carries out the quality assurance procedures.</p> <p>The Ministry of Science and Education is the main body in the process of initial accreditation in terms of issuing the licence, but the procedure is in the larger part conducted by the Agency.</p>
<p>3.3 What are the rules and requirements for accreditation (e.g. are all programmes subject of accreditation or only new programmes? Are only state or public universities to be evaluated? etc)?</p>	<p>All new programmes are required to pass initial accreditation. The existing programmes are subjected to the reaccreditation of the HEI every 5 years, the thematic evaluations and the audit.</p> <p>Both public and private HEIs and programmes carried out at these institutions are subjects of accreditation and evaluation practices.</p>
<p>3.4 Who is allowed to do programme accreditation? Only an official government agency, (like e.g. in Austria) or other (ENQA- or EQAR-) recognized institutions?</p>	<p>The programme accreditation (and reaccreditation) is primarily conducted by the independent agency (Agency for Science and Higher Education - ASHE), meaning ENQA or EQAR -like institution. The final decision on the licence is a prerogative of the Ministry of Science and Education, but the Ministry is bound by the recommendation of the ASHE.</p>
<p>3.5 Who are the evaluators (bureaucrats and/or academic peers, are foreign academic peers involved)?</p>	<p>The evaluating committee who is doing the on-the-ground visit and evaluation of submitted documents is comprised of 5 members (3 from academia, 1 representative of employers, 1 student). One member of academia is foreigner.</p> <p>The Accreditation committee who reaches the decision on proposal (recommendation) is comprised of 11 members representing relevant stakeholders (Rectors' council, Council of Polytechnics and Schools of Professional Higher Education, Croatian Commerce Chamber, Croatian Students Council, National</p>

	Science, Higher Education and Technology Council, scientific institutes, scientists and members of the academic community on the basis of the public call).
3.6 Which methods of accreditation are primarily applied in the respective country?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Initial accreditation • Reaccreditation (and partial reaccreditation) • Audit (periodical external quality evaluation of the internal quality assurance system) • Thematic evaluation
3.7 Who takes the decision to accredit a programme? (is it the institution doing the evaluation or a superior government body?)	The final decision on accreditation and issuing a licence for carrying out the programme is in the hands of the Ministry of Science, based on the detailed accreditation recommendation of the Accreditation Council of the Agency for Science and Higher Education. The wording of the law indicates that the Ministry has no manoeuvring space to decide contrary to the ASHE recommendation.

4. EXISTING PA STUDY PROGRAMMES

4.1 DATA, METHODS AND LIMITATIONS

Data on existing PA study programmes were collected in the period of 1-5 March 2019, with the final completeness check on 10 March 2019.

The main sources of data for the identification of the PA programmes are the databases of the Agency for Science and Higher Education²⁰ maintained by the University Computing Centre of the University of Zagreb - SRCE²¹ and the database of the Ministry of Science and Education.²² For the specific programmes, the websites of the higher education institutions and their programmes are inspected (for the web sources see Annex). Also, the recommendations and evaluations of study programmes prepared by the Agency for Science and Higher Education in the process of initial accreditation or reaccreditation of the study programmes were consulted.²³ In addition, earlier papers identifying the public administration programmes were taken into account (see Koprić, 2013; Lalić Novak and Džinić, 2016; Musa, Lalić Novak and Džinić, 2018).

REGISTER OF STUDY PROGRAMMES

- the official database of the accredited study programmes of the Ministry of Science and Education. The obligation of the Ministry of Science and Education to establish and maintain the register of study programmes is prescribed by the Law on the Science and Higher Education (Article 90, paragraph 6, subparagraph 2).²⁴ The registration of the study programme in the register (upon the finalisation of the accreditation procedure) is a prerequisite for the programme implementation.

Accessible at: <http://mzos.hr/dbApp/pregled.aspx?appName=StudProgrami>

The database contains 1.794 programmes, but some programmes have double entries.

The data in the database include the following information: title of the programme, type of programme (level – undergraduate, graduate, postgraduate, etc. / university or vocational study), HEI responsible / implementing the programme, areas and subdivisions, location, ECTS, duration, qualification, way of implementation (classical, online, etc.), language.

The up to date list of accredited study programmes in a machine-readable format .xls is accessible at the bottom of the page and is also (in the version of 26 August 2016) available at the Open Data Portal in the .csv format.²⁵

MOZVAG – the database of Agency for Science and Higher Education maintained by SRCE

Accessible at: <https://mozvag.srce.hr/preglednik/pregled/hr/pocetna/index.html>

The database contains the list of all accredited study programmes at the Croatian higher education institutions (public and private). Currently there is 1.490 such programmes.

The data include the following information: type of programme (level – undergraduate, graduate, postgraduate, etc.), HEI responsible / implementing the programme, areas and subdivisions (8 areas, from social sciences, over biomedical to arts; and subdivisions), location, ECTS, duration.

²⁰ Agencija za znanost i visoko obrazovanje, <https://www.azvo.hr/>

²¹ Sveučilišni računski centar Sveučilišta u Zagrebu <https://www.srce.unizg.hr/>

²² Ministarstvo znanosti i obrazovanja <https://mzo.hr/>

²³ <https://www.azvo.hr/hr/vrednovanja/postupci-vrednovanja-u-visokom-obrazovanju/reakreditacija-visokih-ucilista>

²⁴ Law on science and higher education, Official Gazette Narodne novine no. [123/03](#), [198/03](#), [105/04](#), [174/04](#), [02/07](#), [46/07](#), [45/09](#), [63/11](#), [94/13](#), [139/13](#), [101/14](#), [60/15](#), [131/17](#)

²⁵ <http://data.gov.hr/dataset/studijski-programi-visokih-ucilista>

MOZVAG database is comprised of several databases which serve as a support to the Agency in implementing its legally described tasks (accreditation, evaluation).

The database also contains the list and data on higher education institutions (currently 119, 104 public and 27 private).

The data in the two databases only contain the programmes which hold valid accreditation licence. The programmes that no longer hold the accreditation licence are not accessible.

Since the public administration programmes may be part of different social sciences area subdivisions (administrative law and public administration, management/economics, political sciences, etc.) or interdisciplinary area, the identification of programmes had to include the analysis of the content of the programme.

Criteria

For the purpose of identifying the PA programmes, the criteria defined in the point 2.1. and 5.1. of the EAPAA Accreditation Criteria (version 9 January 2013)²⁶

- a) academic programmes
- b) in the public administration domain, that
- c) provide the professional academic level of education,
- d) leading to a formal degree, and
- e) preparing students for academic level roles in the public sector or academic public administration teaching or research positions

The programmes of public administration, administration, public management were the core of the targeted programmes. At the next level, the programmes of local and regional government and development were taken into account, as fulfilling the above criteria for the employment in / research of a specific public administration sector.

Since the Croatian public administration education and research has predominantly legal orientation, the law faculties programmes were the first target of inspection, followed by the economy and management programmes, and finally political science programmes. In addition, sociology programmes were analysed.

The programmes that teach a specific discipline although preparing mainly for the employment / research of public sector, were not taken into account (e.g. health or cultural management, crisis management, project management, diplomacy, European studies / integration).

Methodology

As the first step, the identification of study programmes in the databases mentioned above was conducted using the following key words (public administration – javna uprava, public management/public sector management – javni menadžment / menadžment javnog sektora, public governance – javno upravljanje; administration – uprava; administrative/public law – upravno/javno pravo).

In the second step, programmes under different titles (local government, local development) are identified by thoroughly inspecting the rest of the programmes in the category 'social sciences' and 'interdisciplinary programmes'. The list retrieved in the first step is supplemented by the programmes known to the authors in other ways and by inspection of the available analyses.

²⁶ <https://www.eapaa.eu/wp-content/uploads/2015/04/EAPAAAccreditationCriteriaVersion9Jan2013.pdf>

In the third step, the content of each study programme as published at the programme's webpage was analysed in order to evaluate whether the programme can be subsumed under the term 'PA programme'. The analyses of other authors were used to supplement the data (Koprić, 2013; Lalić Novak and Džinić, 2016; Musa, Lalić Novak and Džinić, 2018).

In the fourth and final step, a cleansed list of the programmes was finalised in the Annex 01 Task Country Report by adding information in accordance with the template and with the additional information (columns W-AA).

4.2 EXISTING PA STUDY PROGRAMMES

Croatian Higher Education System in Short

The higher education system in Croatia is a dual system, with university study programmes and professional study programmes, each constituting a separate stream of education. This means that students of professional studies cannot continue to study at the university study programme (e.g. advance to MA university study, after completing BA professional study). However, the recent (2018) changes of the Law on Croatian Qualification Framework²⁷ in Article 6 opened up the possibility of mobility among two streams if the HEIs allow so, but this provision is now being challenged before the Constitutional Court.

As described at the webpages of the Agency for Science and Higher Education²⁸ the university programmes qualify students to work in science and higher education, private and public sector and society in general, as well as to develop and apply scientific and professional knowledge. On the other hand, professional study programmes provide students with an appropriate level of knowledge and skills required to work in applied professions, as well as a direct integration in the working process.

University study programmes are performed at three levels: undergraduate (level 6), graduate (level 7.1) and postgraduate studies (level 7.2 for specialist postgraduate studies, level 8.2 for doctoral studies).

Professional study programmes are split into: short professional studies, undergraduate professional studies (level 6), and specialist graduate professional studies (level 7.1).

At the moment, according to the Mozvag database, in Croatia there are (a) 104 public higher education institutions, which include 8 universities located in the largest cities (Zagreb, Split, Rijeka, Osijek, Pula, Zadar, Dubrovnik, Koprivnica) and their 82 branches (faculties, departments), 11 public polytechnics and 3 public high schools, and (b) 27 private public higher institutions.

The abovementioned 131 HEIs perform 1.219 accredited university study programmes and 270 professional study programmes.

Public Administration Programmes

Out of 104 public higher education institutions, 14 of them (6 largest universities and their faculties or departments) offer some kind of PA programme (see Table 3).

Out of 27 private universities and polytechnics only one is offering a PA programme (MA Public Sector Management as a professional graduate study, Polytechnics Baltazar Zaprešić).

²⁷ Zakon o hrvatskom kvalifikacijskom okviru, Official Gazette Narodne novine no. [22/13, 41/16, 64/18](https://www.zakon.hr/z/566/Zakon-o-Hrvatskom-kvalifikacijskom-okviru)
<https://www.zakon.hr/z/566/Zakon-o-Hrvatskom-kvalifikacijskom-okviru>

²⁸ <https://www.azvo.hr/en/higher-education/types-of-study-programmes-in-the-republic-of-croatia>

In total, as presented in Table 3, 15 HEIs offer 8 PA programmes at the BA level, 6 programmes at the MA level, 8 programmes at the postgraduate specialist level (corresponding MPA), and 4 doctoral studies that prepare for the employment in public administration or the research on public administration. This makes 26 PA programmes, with 20 being clearly PA oriented, including their title (public administration or public management management) and 6 programmes being local government development or human rights / society / democracy programmes.

With regard to student enrolments, the interest of students for PA programmes might be assessed as high, especially in the capital Zagreb and three largest cities, with a selection of suitable candidates. The BA and MA programmes usually enrol up to the limit, with postgraduate programmes opening usually every second year. For illustration, in the academic year 2015/2016, the 8 BA PA programmes received 4.118 applications for 1.033 student placements (575 or 55,67% full-time), with the right to enter being granted to 780 students – each 5th student that applied to the PA programme had the right to enrol. With regard to the postgraduate education, although one could expect a higher interest among a few hundred thousand of public employees, the general impression is that the postgraduate PA programmes (executive and doctoral) encounter difficulties when it comes to the attractiveness of the programmes. The reasons might be found in the lack of incentives related to the work posts and the restricted possibilities for advancement, personal circumstances, especially a work- private life balance, necessity to cover fees (compared to BA and MA which are generally funded from the budget)

With regard to the employment of BA/MA graduates of public administration, the data from the Register of public servants for September 2015 (see Musa, Lalić Novak and Džinić, 2018: 263) indicate that the BA/MA public administration graduates constituted slightly less than 2 percent of the workforce in state administration, justice administration, public establishments and agencies, namely 2.728 (1.33%) out of 205.645 employed (including health and education sector). For the sake of comparison, the number of lawyers was three times higher - 8.925 (4.34%). However, in the state administration, out of 56.212 civil servants, there was 7% of BA/MA graduates, and 23,69% lawyers among university level educated employees, and 3,24% BA/MA graduates and 10,29% lawyers out of total employment in state administration (including police force which constitutes more than half of all employment in the civil service).

a) Undergraduate and graduate level (BA and MA)

The undergraduate and graduate level includes 8 BA (undergraduate) PA programmes (titled public administration, administration studies) and 6 MA (graduate) PA programmes (public administration, administration studies, public sector management).

It is important to say that all BA and MA PA study programmes are thought as professional study programmes, and there is not one PA university study programme.

All BA programmes last 3 years and constitute 180 ECTS while MA programmes last 2 years and constitute 120 ECTS.

The 4 BA and 4 MA programmes are offered by the faculties of law at the four universities (Zagreb, Rijeka, Split, and Osijek). After a long period of the dominance of only BA PA programmes, the MA programmes in duration of 2 years were offered first by the University of Zagreb (since 2012/2013 academic year) and, after a short-term experiment of 1-year MA program (2011-2013), also by other three faculties of law (Split, Rijeka and Osijek, since 2013/2014 or 2014/2015 academic year).

The 4 BA programmes are also offered by 4 polytechnics (Šibenik, Vukovar, Požega, Gospić), with the Polytechnics of Šibenik recently being accredited for the MA programme that will be offered in the 2019/2020 academic year.

One MA programme is offered by the private polytechnics (Baltazar Zaprešić) since the academic year 2016/2017.

The BA programmes enrol altogether approximately 1.050 students per year. The MA programmes enrol between 300 and 400 students per year. For the sake of comparison, in the academic year 2017-2018 there were 160.000 students in Croatia, with approximately 60% students studying at the University of Zagreb, meaning that out of a student population less than 1% is studying at the PA programmes at the BA and MA level. At the same time, the employment in the public sector constitutes approximately 21% of all employment (336 thousand out of 1,5 million).²⁹

The BA and MA programmes offered by the faculties of law (4 BA and 4 MA) and 4 polytechnics (4 BA and 1 MA programme) have a clear legal orientation. Their professional titles are awarded in the social sciences – law – administrative law and public administration. On the other hand, the title at the Polytechnics Baltazar Zaprešić is awarded in the social sciences – economy – management.

The research of Lalić Novak and Džinić (2016) has shown that the legally based courses dominate in the PA programmes as 57% of obligatory and 55% of elective courses have legal base, while 49% of obligatory and 10% of elective courses have PA orientation.³⁰ Other disciplines are represented to a lesser degree – economic orientation or other social sciences (political science, sociology) orientation is found in 5% of obligatory and 12% of elective courses each. The rest of 10% in the group of obligatory and 5% in elective courses falls on the practical courses (practice). It has to be noted that the legal dominance is slightly lower at the polytechnics, given the fact that these polytechnics also offer business and economic programmes and their scholars are included in the PA programmes.

Similarly, in relation to the MA programmes (4 programmes offered at the law faculties), legal courses dominate, although to a slightly lower degree compared to the BA programmes, while PA orientation rises compared to the BA programmes. So 46% of obligatory and 38% of elective courses have legal orientation, while 38% of obligatory and 25% of elective courses have PA orientation. Out of obligatory courses 7% have economic and 7% other social sciences base, while 0% and 15% elective courses have economic or social sciences base. 6% of all obligatory and elective courses have practical dimension.

Out of 14 BA and MA studies, only three offer some kind of specialisation through modules: two MA studies offer specialisation in the second (final) year of study through 2-3 courses (15 to 20 ECTS) in State Administration or Local Government, while one BA offers 4 specialisations in the third (final) year (Organisation and Management, Administrative Law, Economics of Public Administration, International administration).

Most of the programmes include practical part (2-4 weeks practice in public administration) and the final requirement is a preparation of the thesis.

All BA programmes are offered both as a full-time and a part-time study, while MA programmes are offered as both full-time and part-time three institutions (Faculty of Law Zagreb, Polytechnics Šibenik, Polytechnics Baltazar Zaprešić) while 3 faculties of law (Osijek, Rijeka, Split) offer only part-time MA programmes. Baltazar Zaprešić also offers to students to study 50% of their MA programme as a distance learning online programme.

Two HEIs offer their programmes dislocated (Polytechnics in Gospić offers its BA programme in Otočac, Polytechnics Baltazar Zaprešić offers its BA in Zagreb).

b) Postgraduate specialist studies

At the postgraduate specialist level, with 8 programmes offering PA education, the picture shows more diversity in terms disciplines, faculties that offer the programmes and the duration and ECTS. Programmes last 1 or 1,5 or 2 years awarding 60, 90/96 or 120 ECTS in areas of economy (3), law (2),

²⁹ State Statistical Office https://www.dzs.hr/Hrv_Eng/publication/2018/09-02-01_06_2018.htm

<https://arhivanalitika.hr/blog/b2b-ekonomika-javnog-sektora-2-obuhvat-i-velicina-javnog-sektora-u-hrvatskoj/>

³⁰ The research was conducted in the academic year 2015/2016 covering 8 BA programmes and 4 MA programmes (so excluding the newly established programmes at the Polytechnics Baltazar Zaprešić and Polytechnics in Šibenik).

social sciences-interdisciplinary (2) or political science (1). All programmes award the title 'university specialist'.

4 specialist studies have a clear public administration / public management orientation, represented in their title: 1,5-year (96 ECTS) *Public Law and Public Administration* programme at the Faculty of Law in University of Zagreb, 1-year (60 ECTS) *Public Sector Management* programme at the Faculty of Economics University of Rijeka, 1-year (60 ECTS) *Public Administration* interdisciplinary programme at the University of Zagreb (taught jointly by three faculties – of law, of political sciences and of organisation and informatics) and 2-years (120 ECTS) *City Management* programme. Their titles (university specialist) are awarded in social sciences – law (1 Public Law and Public Administration), economy (1 Public Sector Management) or social sciences interdisciplinary area (2 - Public Administration, City Management). The courses request students that are non-graduates in the main disciplines (law, political science, economy) to take an introductory semester and pass the exams.

Other four postgraduate specialist studies are local government oriented, with the emphasis on development / democracy (compared to the City management programme that has law-management basis). These 4 programmes are offered by the faculties of law (1 – *Regional and Local Self-Government Development Management* – Faculty of Law, University Josip Juraj Strossmayer Osijek), economics (2 – *Local Economic Development* – Faculty of Economics University of Zagreb, *European integration, local and regional development* – University Juraj Dobrila Pula) and political sciences (1 - *Local Democracy and Development* – Faculty of Political Sciences, University of Zagreb), so their orientation is primarily in these disciplines. The duration of three programmes is 1 year (60 ECTS), while Regional and Local Self-Government Development Management lasts 1,5 years (90 ECTS).

It is important to notice that so far it was not possible for the students of professional BA and MA studies to continue their education at the university postgraduate specialist level.

It is our estimation that these programmes enrol approximately 100 students per year, with most programmes being open to new students bi-annually.

The combination of MPA-MBA programme is not offered by the Croatian HEIs. The MBA programmes are present (9 business administration programmes at the undergraduate, graduate or postgraduate level) and are clearly oriented to private sector business administration, grounded in economics, with no specific relation to public administration whatsoever.

c) *Doctoral studies*

There are four doctoral studies that offer education for public administration, from the perspective of three different disciplines – 2 at the Faculty of Law University in Zagreb (*Public Law and Public Administration* and *Joint PhD Human Rights, Society and Multilevel Governance*, joint study with the universities in Padua, Athens, Nicosia and Sidney), 1 at the Faculty of Economics University of Rijeka, jointly with the Faculty of Administration University of Ljubljana, Slovenia (*Governance and Economics in the Public Sector*) and 1 by the University of Zadar, Department of Sociology, jointly with the University of Trento, Italy (*Sociology of Regional and Local Development*).

All four programmes last 3 years and award 180 ECTS with the title being awarded in law (Zagreb – Faculty of Law), economics (Rijeka – Faculty of Economics) and sociology (Zadar – Department of Sociology) or interdisciplinary social sciences (Joint PhD Human Rights, Sociology and Multi-Level Governance). Three programmes are taught jointly with partner universities as international joint doctoral degrees (universities in Italy, Slovenia, Greece, Cyprus, Australia).

Table 3 – Existing PA study programmes

Higher Education Institutions	Bachelor SP	Master SP	PhD.	MBA***	MPA*	TOTAL
Public HEIs						
University of Zagreb					2 (2)**	2
University of Zagreb – Faculty of Law	1	1	1 (1)**		1 (1)**	5(4)**
University of Zagreb – Faculty of Economics					1(0)**	1(0)**
University of Zagreb – Faculty Political Sciences					1(0)**	1(0)**
University of Rijeka – Faculty of Law	1	1				2
University of Rijeka – Faculty of Economics / joint study University of Ljubljana, Slovenia			1		1 (1)**	2
University Josip Juraj Strossmayer Osijek – Faculty of Law	1	1			1 (0)**	3 (2)**
University of Split – Faculty of Law	1	1				2
University Juraj Dobrila Pula – Faculty of Economics					1 (0)**	1(0)**
University of Zadar – Department of Sociology / University of Trento, Italy - Joint study			1(0)**			1(0)**
Polytechnics in Šibenik	1	1				2
Polytechnics Lavoslav Ružička in Vukovar	1					1
Polytechnics Nikola Tesla in Gospić	1					1
Polytechnics in Požega	1					1
Private HEIs						
Polytechnics Baltazar Zuprešić		1				1
Foreign universities / colleges						
-						
Other types you would like to distinguish						
-						
TOTAL	8	6	4 (2)**		8 (4)**	26 (20)**

Source: Authors.

**Important notice: postgraduate specialist studies under different titles are acknowledged in the MPA column although there is no programme that would lead to the MPA title itself.*

***Numbers in brackets relate to the number of programmes that have clear public administration or public management orientation (excluding so regional and local development or democracy programmes).*

*** MBA programmes are not specifically relevant for public administration employment or education in Croatia.

In sum, 26 programmes at the BA, MA, postgraduate specialist and doctoral level are offered by the 15 HEIs, with 20 programmes having a clear public administration and/or management orientation, and 6 programmes from different disciplines having local government and development or human rights/sociology/democracy orientation.

All BA and MA programmes are taught as professional programmes, while postgraduate (specialist and doctoral) programmes are taught as university programmes. Thus, there is no mobility between the two streams (at the moment, at least).

The BA and MA level programmes are mainly taught at the law faculties, showing dominance of legal approach to PA administration. Postgraduate level courses (11) are grounded in law (3), economy (4), interdisciplinary social sciences (2), sociology (1), and political sciences (1).³¹

As a trend, in the last 10 year after predominance of the BA PA studies, MA studies emerged (since 2012), while postgraduate studies emerged from 2006, except the PhD in Public Law and Public Administration which was traditionally, for several decades, the main (and only) doctoral study for public administration research and practice.

Hence, legal approach dominates the PA education, with economy-management approach emerging in the last several years by the establishment of PA/PM programmes at the private polytechnics and faculties of economy. PA as a specific discipline is mainly represented at the level of 30-40 percent at the BA/MA level.

Fifteen HEIs compared, it can be said that a significant share (one third) of PA education is performed in Zagreb (and metropolitan area) – out of 26 programmes 9 programmes are performed by the University of Zagreb and its faculties, and 1 programme by the private polytechnics. The next most prominent HEI is University of Rijeka and its faculties (4 programmes), followed by the University of Osijek (3 programmes), University of Split (2 programmes), and Polytechnics in Šibenik (2 programmes). Other HEIs offer one programme each (Požega, Vukovar, Gospić, Zadar).

It can be said that the University of Zagreb, and especially its Faculty of Law is a dominant PA education centre. The Faculty of Law offers BA and MA programmes in PA, postgraduate specialist program in Public Law and PA, and doctoral programme in Public Law and PA, and is also one of the founding faculties for the postgraduate interdisciplinary specialist studies of the University of Zagreb – Public Administration programme, and City management programme. It has to be said that a significant majority of professors and lecturers of public administration who teach BA and MA programmes of PA at faculties of law (and a significant share at the polytechnics) were doctoral students at the Faculty of Law University in Zagreb (*Public Law and Public Administration programme*).

However, it is striking that Croatian HEIs do not offer neither BA nor MA university programmes in Public Administration, but only professional programmes. Also, there is no joint study programmes at the MA level, nor classical MPA programme.

It has to be noted that in order for the new programme to be accredited, the data on (un)employment of specific graduates has to be presented together with the data on the harmonisation of the study programme with the strategy of the HEI and the development strategy of the region. According to the data from Croatian Employment Bureau of 2017 as expressed in one elaboration document,³² the unemployment PA graduates in Croatia ranges around 220 for BA programme graduates and 60 for MA programme graduates.

³¹ BA and MA programme in Zagreb offer some courses in English and receive approximately 3-5 students per year within Erasmus mobility scheme.

³² <http://www.vus.hr/upload/stranice/2019/01/2019-01-07/173/elaboratsusvus3918.pdf>

Other programmes

Public and private universities and polytechnics offer also specific programmes that are inherently oriented towards employment in public administration and public sector, such as International Relations and Diplomacy (BA, MA; Postgraduate), High Police School - Criminalistics (BA, MA), Crisis Management (BA; Postgraduate), Tax administration (BA), European studies (MA, Postgraduate), Preparation and Implementation of the EU funded projects (postgraduate), etc.

From 2016/2017 there is also a PhD programme 'Human Rights, Society, And Multilevel Governance' jointly offered by the University of Law Zagreb, and University of Padua (Italy), Panteion University (Greece), University of Nicosia (Cyprus), that among 12 streams offer a stream on Europeanisation of public administration. For that reason, it is included in the list of PA programmes.

4.3 AVAILABILITY OF INFORMATION ON PA STUDY PROGRAMMES

In general, there is a high level of information availability on the existing PA study programmes. As explained in chapter 4.1. the list and data on the accredited study programmes of public administration can be retrieved from the MOZVAG database and the Register of the study programmes. In these databases, general information on each study programme is available (type, title, duration, ECTS, awarded title, HEI, etc.). Each of the identified study programmes has its own webpage and the webpages are assessed as being pretty informative.

However, when it comes to details, there is a different level of information offered for different programmes. It has to be noted that at the time of preparation of this report some programmes' websites are encountering technical problems (change of the webpage, e.g. Faculties of law in Zagreb and Osijek) which affects the availability of information.

Almost all programmes (unless there are technical problems with links, such as in case of Osijek postgraduate specialist study) offer the basic structure, of the programme with courses, teaching hours, ECTS and teachers, and most of them includes detailed elaboration of the outcomes, admission requirements and completion requirements.

Majority of the programmes provide a detailed structure of each course, learning outcomes and exam requirements, either in form of the links to subpages or in the study programme main document (elaborate).

As a shortcoming, most programmes offer information only in Croatian (even most joint degrees), and some of the programmes do not clearly indicate the person responsible for the programme (chair or director of the programme). Moreover, a few programmes do not present basic information on the programme in a way that is user oriented and that would allow the user to easily grasp the content, learning outcomes and the structure of the programme and find responsible person but link to the Study programme elaborate, a few hundred pages long document that was prepared in the process of accreditation, or provide no general information whatsoever (e.g. PhD programmes at the Faculty of Law, due to recent technical changes).

4.4 SUMMARY

4.1 How many relevant PA study programmes have you identified and what is their structure?	25 PA programmes are identified at the BA (8), MA (6), postgraduate specialist (8) and doctoral level (3) are offered at the 15 HEIs, with 20 programmes having a clear public administration and/or management orientation, and 5 having local government and development orientation. Programmes at the BA and MA level are professional programmes and are law dominated.
4.2 What information are available on the study programmes on their web pages?	All programmes offer information on the structure of the programme, admission and completion requirements, ECTS and teaching staff. Most of the programmes offer detailed structure of each course (content, literature, exam requirements) either at specific sub-pages of the course or in the general document on the course (pdf).

5. CONCLUDING REMARKS, POINTS FOR PRACTITIONERS, CHALLENGES FOR FUTURE

5.1 CONCLUDING REMARKS

The study of public administration has a long tradition in Croatia, and is marked by the dominance of the law which oriented the development of the PA discipline towards a greater role of legal science. . The undergraduate and graduate programmes of public administration are carried out by the faculties of law, and by four polytechnics (mainly BA). It is only recently that other disciplines, such as economics-management, political science and sociology are offering (postgraduate) study programmes in public management and local and regional development.

The in-service training for the public servants is a separate education stream, with the State School of Public Administration being a dominant provider. Recently, the HEIs started to develop and carry out their own in-service training programmes.

There are currently 26 programmes of PA (8 BA, 6 MA, 8 postgraduate specialist, 4 doctoral), with 20 programmes being dominantly PA programmes. At the undergraduate and graduate level all programmes are professional programmes, and not university type academic programmes, meaning that currently the MA graduates have no opportunity to continue their postgraduate education at the university postgraduate programmes.

With regard to the quality assurance system, there is no specific system for the PA programmes. The new programmes are obliged to undergo the process of initial accreditation (by the Ministry of Science and Education and the Agency for Science and Higher Education) while the existing programmes can and will be evaluated in the processes of reaccreditation of the HEIs (every 5 years), the audit (external evaluation of the internal quality system) or thematic evaluation, all carried out by the Agency. In the processes of quality evaluation, the key role is given to the Accreditation council, a 11-member body comprised of the stakeholders, and the evaluation commissions, 5-member evaluation bodies comprised of the representatives of academic institutions, employers and students.

5.2 POINTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR PRACTITIONERS

1. *The importance of administrative practice for public administration education is increasing.* Recognizing the possibilities of exerting influence on the study programmes' content and administrative lecturing can be assigned as the continuous task of the practitioners interested in administrative modernisation. In addition, practitioners have to foster cooperation with scientists and researchers not only for better usage of their competences for improving public policies and administrative practice, but also for accommodating people from academia to search for solutions to the practical problems and for influencing scientists' approach in teaching public administration.

Practical approach to administrative education is frequently attributed to Anglo-American space (Raadschelders, 1999: 287; Bouckaert, 2008: 13), although it has also been incorporated in continental-European administrative education since the 18th century cameralism (Koprić, Marčetić, 2003: 215–216).

A number of contemporary administrative studies are more and more oriented towards practical needs of public administrations, as quality and practically educated personnel is essential for successful administrative organisations (Stare, 2007: 254). Training of practical skills, with internship as a desirable form, is becoming an inevitable component of public administrative education (Accreditation Criteria, 2011: 6).

Various practical aspects are embedded in administrative studies and other forms of education (Clarke, 1998: 400, 402 etc.; Greenwood, Robins, 1998: 412).

It should not be forgotten that theories can be excellent practical instruments, beside their usage in scientific work, but only if they are used for widening orientation and understanding of well-informed practitioners (Morgan, 1997: 347–353). They can influence practice, if scientists participate in policy design and administrative development and change concepts, ways of perceiving practical problems and practitioners' vocabulary (see also Verhaak, 1997; Ferlie, Geraghty, 2005: 440). Indeed, theories in public administration should be practical (Miller, King, 1998).

From the practitioners' standpoint, practice influences theoretical work – dominant attitudes of administrative practitioners, politicians, citizens and businesses have effects on dominant doctrines and theories (Raadschelders, 1999: 297), as well as on administrative education itself.

Finally, there are attempts to teach public administration using the case method (Robyn, 1998), which is a way of introducing practice into formal administrative education.

2. *Ties between education and in-service training become tighter and tighter.* Education and in-service training are becoming parts of the same system of life-long learning. To stop learning after gaining certain educational degree seems impossible in today's world. New technologies, problems, approaches and tasks ask for continuous learning and training. On one hand, many new training institutions have been established in recent decades worldwide, engaging numerous academicians on non-career basis. On the other hand, universities engage administrative practitioners and offer wider and wider forms of professional upgrading and training (Kavran, 2003: 78 etc.). Although there is observable mushrooming of new in-service training institutions closely connected with governments, many universities and other high education institutions offer in-service training programmes.³³ There is also a possibility to make a collaborative arrangement between an in-service institution and a university.

Because Croatia mostly follows this developmental path Croatian practitioners have to search for cooperation opportunities with academia, designing comprehensive life-long learning system which includes not only new in-service institutions but also all sorts of practice-oriented educational forms developing within and in collaboration with academia.

3. *'Demands and supply' approach continuously develops, being a strong instrument in the hands of administrative practitioners.* When public administration generalists are not educated in the institutions closely connected with governments (like ENA and similar institutions), which can ensure easy employment of their graduates, the match between governments' needs on one hand and knowledge, skills and competences of graduates on the other becomes problematic. In such cases, when there is no firm structural relationship between a government and a university, it is desirable that the government defines its demands from graduates, and that the university re-assesses its supply.³⁴

Governments should explicitly list their educational expectations (»labour market demands«) in order to employ the best people in the civil service, and universities should adapt their supply to such expectations in order to gain »credibility from potential employers of their graduates« (Toonen, Verheijen, 1999: 193). Such attempts, to connect programmes with the needs of practice lead to demand-driven design of educational programmes, are increasingly often present in the field worldwide despite the noticeable regrets that »curricula are developed on the basis of tradition and 'supply' capacities« (Nemec et al., 2011: 136).

³³ In *The Technique of Municipal Administration* (1958) the International City Managers' Association recommended, among other institutional arrangements, cooperation between city governments and colleges and universities in executing in-service trainings (1958: 209).

³⁴ Certain governments, such as in Poland (Nemec et al., 2011: 130–131), Bulgaria (Devjak et al., 2007: 235), Russia (Barabashev, Kastrel, 2012), etc. formally define the content of public administration education.

There are several interconnected initiatives and attempts to establish and keep the standards in public administrative education, including the UN *Standards of Excellence for Public Administration Education and Training* in 2008 (Standards), NASPAA's *Accreditation Standards for Master's Degree Programs*, etc. (see also Clark, Pal, 2011: 961–962). European Association for Public Administration Accreditation (EAPAA) applies its *Accreditation Criteria* to all categories of public administration study programmes of general profile: bachelor and graduate/master's degree, comprehensive, specialisation, etc., including public administration, public policy, public management, public affairs, government studies, and the like. They recognize multidisciplinary nature of public administration study programmes.

'Demands and supply' approach strengthen the position of administrative practitioners because they can effectively influence the study programmes in the PA field. However, the basic prerequisites for the successful application of this approach, and for realisation of the practitioners' influence, are thorough job analysis in administrative organisations, appropriate design of the PA posts, and systematisation of necessary competencies. Only if that basis is well prepared, practitioners are able to list accreditation standards for PA educational programmes.

5.3 CHALLENGES FOR FUTURE

To our assessment, the challenges for PA programmes include the following:

- ***The need for the establishment of the graduate and undergraduate university study***

Currently the PA programmes taught at the BA and MA level are offered as a type of vocational studies, and not university studies. Given the current HEI rules, the vocational studies graduates do not have access to the doctoral university programmes. In addition to that, for some positions in the PA vocational studies are not sufficient. As indicated in the first chapters, Croatia has had a binary high education system since the mid-1990s, with university programmes on one hand and vocational programmes on the other. Vocational programmes can be organised by colleges, by polytechnics, and, recently, by public universities. However, at that time, all programmes lasting 3 years or less were designated as vocational programmes, regardless of their content.

The university programmes would ensure that the new generation of researchers develop within the PA discipline (current researchers are mostly law educated, with a few political scientists) and that the discipline has a greater acceptance in the PA system.

- ***The necessity of internationalisation of the programmes by attracting international students and offering joint degrees, especially at the MA and postgraduate specialist level***

The lack of international dimension of the programmes is visible. In addition to a dozen exchange students each year, there are no foreign students studying PA at the Croatian universities or polytechnics. The internationalisation of the programmes would have a positive effect on the development of the discipline and the researchers, exchange of knowledge and skills and more proactive approach.

- ***Acquiring standards of PA education through international (European) accreditation process***

A future step for the established PA programmes, as well as the new programmes, should be to engage in the process of PA programmes accreditation. This decision would enhance and incentivise the further modernisation and internationalisation of the programmes and expectedly confirm that the high-quality standards of PA teaching are applied. However, the decision to undergo the accreditation is dependable mostly on the financial aspects and capacity of the institution (which also teach other programmes) to engage in the process.

- ***The necessity of making postgraduate studies more attractive to civil, public and local servants, in terms of flexibility of the study, the effects of the diploma on their position and salary, the distance learning methods introduction***

As underlined in previous chapters, the postgraduate studies do not attract as many students as it could be expected given the number of public sector employees. Among the reasons, the fact that the postgraduate specialist studies (of any kind) are not recognized in the Public administration and do not make a difference with regard to the salary or advancement (except in some local government or agencies) could be perceived as one of the most deterring aspects in relation to the decision of the public administrator to continue education. In addition, most of the programmes are not designed for the non-lawyers or non-economist, what makes all sort of other specialist in public administration not eligible for executive education. The more flexible programmes, with modules and short executive programmes offered in addition to a degree programme would make the programmes more attractive and enhance the reputation of the programme and of the institution.

- ***The necessity to introduce online courses, especially in order to improve the possibilities of local servants and international students to enrol in the programmes.***

An online study (in part or fully) would help professionals who try to balance their private and professional life and especially those who do not live or work in the cities where PA education is not offered, to decide to enrol and to continue their education. The online learning would also help attracting international students.

- ***The future position of social science studies in the strategic documents and financing by the central government***

In the last decade the voices diminishing the role of the social sciences in general, and the law, sociology, political sciences, humanities and similar for the social and economic development have been louder and louder. In addition, the fascination with the technology and the ICT in the course of digital revolution, incentivised the development of technical programmes at Croatian universities and polytechnics. The unemployment statistics shows that many graduates in social sciences cannot find job in Croatia. This is also expected to some extent for technical disciplines, but their labour market crosses the state borders. In short, given the talks on the necessity of educational programmes to reflect the needs of market, we believe that the challenge in the coming years will be to protect the current PA programmes (together with other social sciences programmes).

6. REFERENCES

With references on Croatian PA education

- Bošnjaković, D. (2015). Stručno usavršavanje hrvatskih državnih službenika u Centru za stručno osposobljavanje i usavršavanje službenika i Državnoj školi za javnu upravu (Professional training of Croatian civil servants in the Centre for professional training and development of servants and in the State School for Public Administration). Final thesis. Postgraduate specialist program of Public Administration. University of Zagreb.
- Koprić, Ivan (2013) Governance and Administrative Education in South Eastern Europe. Genuine developments, conditionality, and hesitations. *Hrvatska i komparativna javna uprava – Croatian and Comparative Public Administration* 13(1): 5-39 <https://hrcak.srce.hr/130636>
- Koprić, Ivan (2012) Managing Public Affairs in South Eastern Europe: Muddled Governance. In: Ann Marie Bissessar (ed.) *Governance. Is It for Everyone?* New York: Nova Science Publishers
- Koprić, Ivan (2011) Contemporary Croatian Public Administration on the Reform Waves. *Godišnjak Akademije pravnih znanosti Hrvatske/Yearbook of the Croatian Academy of Legal Sciences* 2(1): 1–39.
- Koprić, Ivan (2009) Attracting and Retaining the Best People in Public Service. http://www.rcpar.org/mediaupload/events/HRMCoP/20091001_Attracting_Retaining_BestPeople_FI N.pdf.
- Koprić, Ivan (2007) Suvremeno obrazovanje za javnu upravu. *Analiza hrvatskog politološkog društva* 4(1): 375-395 <https://hrcak.srce.hr/29139>
- Koprić, Ivan (2007) Trendovi u razvoju i mogućnosti kvalitetnijeg upravnog obrazovanja u Hrvatskoj (Trends in Development and the Possibilities of Quality Administrative Education in Croatia). In: *Reforma pravnog obrazovanja (Reform of Legal Education)*. Zagreb: Croatian Academy of Science and Arts.
- Koprić, Ivan, Goranka Lalić Novak, Iva Lopižić (2012a) Neke osnovne informacije o obrazovanju za javnu upravu u Hrvatskoj (Basic Data on Public Administration Education in Croatia). Prepared for the Croatian Ministry of Public Administration, unpublished.
- Koprić, Ivan, Gordana Marčetić (2003) Education of Administrative Personnel: Experiences and Challenges. In: Ivan Koprić (ed.) *Modernisation of the Croatian Public Administration*. Zagreb: Faculty of Law and Konrad Adenauer Stiftung.
- Lalić Novak, Goranka, Jasmina Džinić (2016) Upravno obrazovanje u Hrvatskoj: stanje i perspektive /Public administration education in Croatia: the current state and the perspectives/ In: Musa, Anamarija (ed) *10. forum za javnu upravu, Profesionalna javna uprava: stanje i perspektive obrazovanja za javnu upravu*. Zagreb: Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, Institut za javnu upravu, pp. 25-44 http://iju.hr/Dokumenti/fju_10.pdf
- Marčetić, Gordana, Ivan Koprić (2009) Building the System of Public Administration Education and Training in Croatia: Per Aspera ad Astra? Paper for the Annual Conference of the International Association of Schools and Institutes of Administration (IASIA), Rio de Janeiro, 3-8 August 2009 *Governance for Sustainable Development: Implications for Public Administration Education and Practice*, pp. 1–22.
- Musa, Anamarija, Goranka Lalić Novak, Jasmina Džinić (2018) Obrazovanje za javnu upravu: pravo, javna uprava i uloga kvalifikacijskog okvira /Public Administration Education: law, public administration and the role of the qualification framework/ In: Grubišić, Ksenija (ed) *Primjena kvalifikacijskog okvira i radne karijere studenata Pravnog fakulteta Sveučilišta u Zagrebu*. Zagreb: Pravni fakultet Sveučilišta u Zagrebu, 2018, pp. 253-289
- Musa, Anamarija, Jasmina Džinić (2012) Europska regulacija profesija i komore u Hrvatskoj: razvoj upravne profesije i drugih profesija u javnoj upravi /European professional regulation and the professional chambers in Croatia: development of administrative profession and other professions in public administration. Zagreb: Institut za javnu upravu. http://iju.hr/Dokumenti/pub_4.pdf

- Musa, Anamarija, Vedran Đulabić, Tijana Vukojičić, Mihovil Škarica (2007a) *Obrazovanje za javnu upravu: pregled diplomskih programa javne uprave u zapadnoeuropskim zemljama* (Public Administration Education: An Overview of Master Programmes in Western European Countries). *Hrvatska javna uprava* 7(2): 289–317.
- Musa, Anamarija, Vedran Đulabić, Tijana Vukojičić, Mihovil Škarica (2007b) *Obrazovanje za javnu upravu: pregled diplomskih programa javne uprave u tranzicijskim zemljama* (Public Administration Education: An Overview of Master Programmes in Transition Countries). *Hrvatska javna uprava* 7(3): 563–594.
- Pavić, Željko (2003) *The Key Moments in the Development of Administrative Education in Croatia*. In: Ivan Koprić (ed.) *Modernisation of the Croatian Public Administration*. Zagreb: Faculty of Law and Konrad Adenauer Stiftung.
-
- Bouckaert, Geert (2008) *Teaching Public Administration: Some Trends in Europe. The Future of the European University*, *Köz-Gazdaság*, 2008/3, Special issue, 9–14.
- Clark, Ian D., Leslie A. Pal (2011) *Master's of Public Administration and of Public Policy: An Analysis of Academic Programs and Professional Competencies in Canada*. *Hrvatska i komparativna javna uprava/Croatian and Comparative Public Administration* 11(4): 947–984.
- Clarke, Michael (1998) *The Challenges Facing Public Service Training Institutions*. *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 64(3): 399–407.
- Ferlie, Ewan, Keith J. Geraghty (2005) *Professionals in Public Services Organizations: Implications for Public Sector »Reforming«*. In: Ewan Ferlie, Laurence E. Lynn, Jr., Christopher Pollitt (eds.) *The Oxford Handbook of Public Management*. Oxford University Press.
- Greenwood, John, Lynton Robins (1998) *Public Administration Curriculum Development in Britain: Outsider or Insider Influence?* *International Review of Administrative Sciences* 64(3): 409–421.
- Kavran, Dragoljub (2003) *Javna uprava: reforma – trening – efikasnost* (Public Administration: Reform – Training – Efficiency). Beograd: Savet za državnu upravu Vlade Srbije etc.
- Miller, Hugh T., Cheryl Simrell King (1998) *Practical Theory*. *American Review of Public Administration* 28(1): 43–60.
- Nemec, Juraj, David Spacek, Patrycja Suwaj, Artur Modrzejewski (2011) *Does Public Administration Higher Education in CEECs Reflect Demands Created by NPM Reforms? Review of Economic Perspectives / Národohospodársky Obzor* 11(3): 124–140.
- Raadschelders, Jos C. N. (1999) *A Coherent Framework for the Study of Public Administration*. *Journal of Public Administration: Research and Theory* 9(2): 281–303.
- Randma-Liiv, Tiina, Bernadette Connaughton (2005) *Public Administration as a Field of Study: Divergence or Convergence in the Light of »Europeanization«?* *Trames* 9(4): 348–360.
- Toonen, Theo A. J., Tony J. G. Verheijen (assisted by Ineke van Beusekom) (1999) *Public Administration Education in Europe: In Need of Convergence and Europeanization?* *Revista Transilvană de Științe Administrative* 1(2): 184–209.
- Verhaak, Frans O. M. (1997) *Shifting Frames of Reference in Dutch Autonomisation Reforms*. In: Walter J. M. Kickert (ed.) *Public Management and Administrative Reform in Western Europe*. Cheltenham i Northampton: Edward Elgar.

7. ANNEX

Annex : Examples of PA programmes

UNIVERSITY OF ZAGREB, FACULTY OF LAW, STUDY CENTRE FOR PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND PUBLIC FINANCES - BACHELOR OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (180 ECTS)

COURSE	ECTS	Required/ elective
YEAR 1 / WINTER		
Introduction to State and Law	7	required
Public Administration	7	required
Basics of Sociology	7	required
Basics of Political Science	7	required
Foreign Language for Public Administration (English, German)	2	required
YEAR 1 / SUMMER		
Constitutional Law of the Republic of Croatia	9	required
Public Administration	7	required
Basics of Information Science	5	required
Financing of Public Administration	7	required
Foreign Language for Public Administration (English, German)	2	required
YEAR 2 / WINTER		
State Administration	6,5	required
Basics of Company Law	5	required
Introduction to Civil Law	6,5	required
European Administrative Space and National Administration	5	required
General Administrative Law	5	required
Foreign Language for Public Administration (English, German)	2	required
YEAR 2 / SUMMER		
Family Law with Registration	7	required
Labour and Social Security Law	7	required
Human Resources Management with Basics of Civil Servants' Law	7	required
General Administrative Law	7	required
Foreign Language for Public Administration (English, German)	2	required

Module	YEAR 3 / WINTER		
	Administrative Procedural Law	7	required

Organisational-Managerial	Introduction to Public Management	5	required for module
Organisational-Managerial	Basics of Organization Theory	5	required for module
Organisational-Managerial	Basic Comparative Systems	5	required for module
Administrative-Legal	European Administrative Law	5	required for module
Administrative-Legal	Public Services	5	required for module
Administrative-Legal	Construction (Building) Administrative Law	5	required for module
Administrative-Economic	Business Economics	5	required for module
Administrative-Economic	Multi-level Governance and Regional Development	5	required for module
Administrative-Economic	Public Economy Sector	5	required for module
International-Administrative	European Union Law	5	
International-Administrative	Comparative Constitutional Law	5	required for module
International-Administrative	Consular Law	5	required for module
	Informatics Workshop	3	required
	Nomotechnics Exercises	3	required
	Professional Practice	2	required

YEAR 3 / SUMMER		
Local Self-Government	7	required
Administrative Procedural Law-Exercises	4	required
E-Government	5	elective
Electoral Systems	5	elective
Public Policies in Practice	5	elective
Public Relations in Public Administration	5	elective
Basics of Social Policy	5	
Police Administrative Law	5	elective
History of Croatian Administration	5	elective
Environmental Law	5	
Social Security Law	5	elective
Accountancy and Financial Reporting in Public Sector	5	elective
Records Management	5	elective
Land Registry Law	5	elective
Thesis	9	required

UNIVERSITY OF ZAGREB, FACULTY OF LAW, STUDY CENTRE FOR PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION AND PUBLIC FINANCES - MASTER OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (120 ECTS)

COURSE	ECTS	Required /elective	
YEAR 1 / WINTER SEMESTER			
Comparative Public Administration	5	required	
Judicial Control of Administration	5	required	
Public Management	5	required	
Sociology of Public Administration	5	required	
City Management and Urban Development Management	3	elective	
Public Procurement	3	elective	
Information Communication Technology in Public Administration	3	elective	
Human Rights	3	elective	
Migrations, Asylum and Foreigners	3	elective	
Psychology in Public Administration	3	elective	
Social Policy of Croatia	3	elective	
Seminar I.	4	required	
YEAR 1 / SUMMER SEMESTER		30	
Public Policies in Croatia	5	required	
Civil Service Law	5	required	
Public-Private Partnership	5	required	
Comparative Political Systems	5	required	
European Anti-Discrimination Law	5	elective	
Financing of Big Cities	3	elective	
Information Services of Modern Public Administration	3	elective	
Relations Between Citizens and Administration	3	elective	
Legal Aspects of Information Management	3	elective	
Social Law	3	elective	
Civil Society and Public Administration	3	elective	
National Minorities and Public Administration	3	elective	
Foreign Language for Public Administration (English, German)	3	elective	
Seminar II.	4	required	
YEAR 2 / WINTER SEMESTER			
		30	
	Organization Theory	5	required
	Organizational Development	5	required
	International Relations, Foreign Policy and Diplomacy	5	required
Module A: State Administration	Modernisation and Europeanisation of Croatian Administration	5	required in module
Module A: State Administration	Contemporary Administrative Doctrines	5	required in module
Module A: State Administration	Misdemeanour Law	5	required in module
Module B: Local Self-Government	Decentralisation Management	5	required in module
Module B: Local Self-Government	Local Public Services	5	required in module
Module B: Local Self-Government	Local and Regional Development	5	required in module
YEAR 2 / SUMMER SEMESTER		30	
	Ethics in Public Service	5	required
	Project Management	5	required

	Regulatory Management	5	required
	Graduate thesis	15	required

UNIVERSITY OF ZAGREB, POSTGRADUATE SPECIALIST STUDY OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (60 ECTS)
(title: univ. spec. admin. publ.)

POSTGRADUATE SPECIALIST STUDY 'PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION'	60	
Croatian State Administration (Organisation, Functioning and Modernisation)	9	required
Local Self-government and Decentralisation	9	required
Public Policy	9	required
Public Management	9	required
Administrative Law – National and European Aspects	9	required
National Administration and European Administrative Space	5	elective, I. sem
Economics of Public Administration	5	elective, I. sem
Civil Society and Public Administration	5	elective, I. sem
ICT Support to Public Administration	5	elective, I. sem
Public Services	5	elective, II. sem
HRM in Public Administration	5	elective, II. sem
Administrative Procedure Law	5	elective, II. sem
Records Management	5	elective, II. sem
Final thesis	5	required